

total length: 01:21:40

engl. title: Questions & Answers concerning »Praise to Dharmadhatu« by Nagarjuna

subtitle: Questions & Answers concerning vers 38-42 »The Dharmadhatu of the Six Sense Faculties« plus various others

quality: high

translator: Ari

listened: 1706

remarks: very animated talk where KR uses a lot of english; lots of quotations from Nagarjuna etc.

@ 00:00:55

@ 00:01:15

KR sings the complete Milarepa »Song of the profound definitive Meaning song on the Snowy Range« གངས་མགུར་ངེས་དོན་ཟབ་མོ་ {gangs mgur nges don zab mo} in the very slow Chöd {gcod} melody from the »Cycle of the Snowy Range« {gangs mgur gyi skor} p.222

[རྗེ་སྤྲེལ་པའི་ལབས་ལ་སྤྱི་བོས་འདུད།

[བྱིན་རྒྱབས་ཀྱི་དངོས་གྲུབ་མཁའ་འགྲོས་བྱིན། །དམ་ཚིག་གི་བདུད་ཅི་ཡན་པ་ཆེ།
།དད་པའི་མཚོད་པས་དབང་བོ་གསོས། །སུ་སློབ་ཀྱི་ཚོགས་གསོག་བཟང་ནས་བྱུང་།]

quote: {/lta ba'i sems la stong nyid shar}

[ལྟ་བའི་སེམས་ལ་སྟོང་ཉིད་ཤར། །བལྟ་རྒྱུད་འོ་བོ་རུལ་ཚམ་མེད།
།བལྟ་བྱ་ལྟ་བྱེད་སྟོར་ནས་ཐལ། །ལྟ་བའི་རྟོགས་ཚུལ་བཟང་ནས་བྱུང་།]

[སྟོམ་པ་འོད་གསལ་ཚུ་བའི་རྒྱན། །བསྟོམ་རྒྱུད་ཐུན་མཚམས་གཟུང་རྒྱ་མེད།
།བསྟོམ་བྱ་སྟོམ་བྱེད་སྟོར་ནས་ཐལ། །སྟོམ་པའི་སྟིང་རུས་བཟང་ནས་བྱུང་།]

[སྟོད་པའི་བྱ་བྱེད་འོད་གསལ་དང་། །རྟེན་འབྲེལ་སྟོང་པར་ཐག་ཚོད་པས།
།སྟེང་བྱ་སྟོད་བྱེད་སྟོར་ནས་ཐལ། །སྟོད་པའི་བྱེད་ཚུལ་བཟང་ནས་བྱུང་།]

[ཕྱོགས་ཆའི་རྟོག་པ་དབྱིངས་སུ་ཡལ། །འོ་སྟོག་ཚོས་བརྒྱུད་རེ་དོགས་མེད།
།བསྟུང་བྱ་སྟུང་བྱེད་སྟོར་ནས་ཐལ། །དམ་ཚིག་སྟུང་ཚུལ་བཟང་ནས་བྱུང་།]

[རང་སེམས་ཚོས་སྐར་ཐག་ཚོད་ཅིང་། །རང་གཞན་དོན་གཉིས་གྲུབ་པའི་ཕྱིར།

|བསྐྱབ་བྱ་སྐྱབ་བྱེད་སྟོར་ནས་ཐལ། |འབྲས་བུ་ཀྲུ་ཚུལ་བཟང་ནས་བྱུང་།

[|མི་ཚན་ང་ཡི་སྦྱིད་སྲུ་འདི། |དད་ཅན་ཉ་མའི་ལུས་ཡན་ཡིན།

|སྐྱབ་པའི་སྐྱ་མཚམས་ཁ་བས་བསྐྱམས། |འཚོ་བའི་ཞབས་ཏོག་མཁའ་འགྲོས་བཀྲིས།
|གཡའ་གངས་ཀྱི་འབབ་ཚུ་བདུང་བའི་མཚོག། |སྲུས་སྐྱབ་མེད་པར་དཔལ་ལས་གྲུབ།
|ལས་བྱ་དགོས་མེད་པར་སོ་ནམ་ཚར། |འཕྲལ་གསོག་འཛོག་མེད་པར་བང་མཛོད་གང་།

|སེམས་ལ་བཏྲས་པས་ཐམས་ཅད་མཐོང་། |དམན་སར་བཅད་པས་རྒྱལ་ས་བྱིན།
|མདུན་མ་ཡང་ཅེ་སྲུ་མའི་དྲིན། |བྱ་སྐྱོབ་ཡོན་བདག་འཁོར་བཅས་རྣམས།

|དད་པས་ཞབས་ཏོག་བྱེད་པ་ཡི། |དྲིན་ཡན་ཚས་ཀྱིས་འཇལ་བ་ཡིན། |ཐུགས་དགུས་པར་མཛོད་ཅིག་འདིར་བྱོན་རྣམས།]
|ཞེས་གསུངས་པས།

Milarepa »The Profound Definitive Meaning Sung on the Snowy Range«
གངས་མགུར་ངེས་དོན་ཟབ་མོ་ {gangs mgur nges don zab mo}

Supreme guru, I bow down at your feet

The siddhis of blessings come straight from the dakinis
Samaya's nectar is the most nourishing drink
Your offering of faith has kept me so healthy
This way of gathering merit, it works quite well

For the mind that masters view, the emptiness dawns
In the content seen, not even an atom exists
A seer and seen, refined until they're gone
This way of realizing view, it works quite well

When meditation is clear light river flow
There is no need to confine it to sessions and breaks
Meditator and object, refined until they're gone
This heart bone of meditation, it beats quite well

When you're sure that conduct's work is luminous light
And you're sure that interdependence is emptiness
A doer and deed, refined until they're gone
This way of working with conduct, it works quite well

When biased thinking has vanished into space
No phony facades, eight dharmas, nor hopes and fears,
A keeper and kept, refined until they're gone
This way of keeping samaya, it works quite well

When you've finally discovered your mind is dharmakaya
And you're really doing yourself and others good
A winner and won, refined until they're gone
This way of winning results, it works quite well

Oh faithful students, to answer your request
This old man is singing a song of happiness

The snow fell and sealed me in my retreat
Where the dakinis gave me all I need
The pure snow water was so delicious
With nobody practicing, practice was glorious
Without ever working, the harvest was perfectly reaped
Without accumulating wealth, the treasure chest was filled

Looking at mind, I see everything
By staying low, I have come to seize the throne
I have reached the highest peak—that's the guru's kindness to me

Now sons and daughters, students gathered here
In answer to your faithful service
I sing this song, teaching you the true Dharma
My benefactors, may it fill your hearts with joy
May all your hearts be filled with joy!
translation Jim Scott and Ari Goldfield

@ 00:03:54

KR suggests that the verse on view and the verse on fruition is according to the view of the Prasangika +prasaGgika

@ 00:04:17 the verse on meditation and conduct speak about clear light and are therefore in the category of the third turning of the wheel and in accordance with the Uttaratantra and the Empty of Other {gzhan stong}

@ 00:04:42

the verse on Samaya is in accordance with the Vajrayana, teaching
»beyond keeping«

@ 00:06:52

now from »The Praise to Dharmadhatu« the verses on the »Twelve
Ayatanas« [recited in common]

@ 00:07:32

request to sing KR's commentary to [»The Praise to Dharmadhatu«](#) [»The Concise Explanation of Dharmadhatu Called: The Mind Itself—Dharmadhatu's Luminous Expanse](#) commentary to [»Praise to Dharmadhatu«](#) by Nagarjuna +nAgArjuna

Namo Shri Guru Nagarjuna!

It's the secret expanse of all the Victors' hearts
It's the path exalted by the noble bodhisattvas
The wellspring of all in existence and beyond
To Dharmadhatu, mind that's radiant and clear, I bow down. 1

It's tough to realize and realizing it's so great
It's tough to teach it all and if you tried you'd never end
The most profound of what's profound's essence-nectar it contains
That the faithful's relaxed wisdom will expand, I shall explain. 2

Divide the eye into its parts and you find no eye
Divide the parts into atoms and you find no parts
Since in the atoms partless things do not exist
All of these are naturally just Dharmadhatu's great expanse. 3

Focal condition form transcends definition
Since there's neither one nor many, there's nothing to define
Break down the word defined and you can't find anything
So it's all completely cool—it's all just true being! 4

Since its conditions' attributes are Dharmadhatu
The eye sense-consciousness doesn't arise, cease, or remain
And it has always been pure of thoughts—
Its attributes as well are Dharmadhatu's expanse. 5

Focal and empowering conditions and consciousness
Never move a single bit from Dharmadhatu's expanse

But our habitual thoughts prevent us from seeing this
We think faculty and object and mind are different things. 6

To purify all the thoughts that obscure our wisdom
With view gain certainty in Dharmadhatu's openness
Meditate and you'll get good at being open and relaxed
And then the Dharmadhatu, always free, will manifest. 7

Appearance-emptiness is the ear, like a dream
Resonance-emptiness is sound, like an echo
Free of conditions, consciousness, mere clarity-emptiness
All three are Dharmadhatu, clear light and nothing more. 8

This nose sense-faculty made up of the four elements
Transcends being one thing or being many things
So it has no self-nature like an image in a mirror
Know that it is never born, know that it's Dharmadhatu. 9

Some odors are created and some come naturally
And though they merely appear due to cause and condition
Their basic nature is Dharmadhatu, clear light
And apart from that they don't exist in any way at all. 10

The nose sense-consciousness that comes from the two conditions
Is free of thoughts connecting a name to what it perceives
And in essence it never comes into being
So the nose sense-consciousness is nothing but Dharmadhatu. 11

The tongue sense-faculty that perceives taste—
When profound wisdom searching for ultimacy goes to work
It can't find anything because there's nothing really there
So know that the tongue is Dharmadhatu. 12

Sweet, sour, hot and salty—all the different kinds of taste
Unanalyzed, there is a mere experience of them by tongue
But when we analyze, we can't find any essence
So we assert that they're appearance-emptiness, Dharmadhatu. 13

This nonconceptual, lucid, aware tongue-consciousness—
If its causes and conditions are nothing but Dharmadhatu
Then how could its own nature exist in any way?

Now we know it's emptiness and clarity—Dharmadhatu. 14

This body that is pure, that isn't made of particles
Is just like the body that appears in a dream
Appearing while empty, and while empty it appears—
Appearance-emptiness inseparable—this body's amazing! 15

Soft and rough, heavy and light—all the kinds of contact
Exist only in mutual dependence back and forth
Essentially the same, their nature is clear light
How wonderful! Fantastic! An amazing miracle! 16

Free of arising and ceasing is the body consciousness
Its focal and empowering conditions have no essence
So it's clarity-emptiness, simplicity, Dharmadhatu
Abiding in clarity-emptiness is meditation at its best. 17

The ceasing of the prior moment of consciousness
Is the empowering condition, the mental sense-faculty
But it does not come or go, and it does not abide
So it's merely Dharmadhatu, it's merely clear light. 18

Good and bad phenomena that become objects of mind—
Opposites have to depend upon each other to exist
And all dependently existent things are equality
So they're appearance-emptiness, so they're all great miracles! 19

The mental consciousness, mere lucid awareness
Does not arise or cease, isn't bound or set free
Clarity-emptiness, the inexpressible expanse
Like a wish-fulfilling jewel, this mind's a miracle! 20

By all of this virtue may all sentient beings
Manifest the Dharmadhatu, mind's radiant clarity
And in this Buddha realm of infinite purity
May the teachings of the Great Secret flourish perfectly! 21
Translated by Ari Goldfield

@ 00:07:48

[Questions & Answers](#)

@ 00:08:00

question re the relationship between the six sense-faculties and consciousness and the mental sense faculty

@ 00:09:55

detailed answer

about the arising of the mental sense-faculty

@ 00:11:38

@ 00:13:12

@ 00:14:52

@ 00:15:43

about the mental sense-faculty during sleep being awakened by habitual tendencies

@ 00:19:03

@ 00:19:25

Milarepa in his song »The Twenty Seven Cases of Dissolution« {thim pa gnyer bdun} from «The Cycle of The Demoness from Lingpa Drag« {ling pa brag srin mo'i skor} p.240

quote: {bag chags dang zhen chags 'dzin chags gsum}

|བག་ཆགས་དང་ཞེན་ཆགས་འདྲིན་ཆགས་གསུམ།

|བྱང་ཡང་ཀུན་གཞི་རང་ལས་བྱང་།

|ཐིམ་ཡང་ཀུན་གཞི་རང་ལ་ཐིམ།

Attachment as patterns, perceptions, holding on
Whenever these appear, from the all-base they appear
And when they dissolve, into the all-base they dissolve
Translation Jim Scott

@ 00:21:58

This song illustrates best Milarpa's view of the mind only school {cittamatra}

@ 00:22:19

@ 00:22:52

@ 00:23:17

about the arising of the mental sense-faculty in the Svatantrika and Prasangika

@ 00:24:09

@ 00:25:14

about the arising of the mental sense-faculty in Mahamudra

@ 00:26:36

@ 00:27:48

@ 00:29:38

Question:

Difference between a god and Dharmadhatu in saying that the wellspring of everything in Samsara and Nirvana is Dharmadhatu?

@ 00:31:22

Answer:

@ 00:33:30

@ 00:33:27

@ 00:34:08

Saraha said:

quote: {sems nyid gcig pu kun gyi sa bon te}

།སེམས་ཉིད་གཅིག་ལུ་ཀུན་གྱི་ས་བོན་ཏེ།

།གང་ལས་སྲིད་དང་མུ་ངན་འདས་འཕྲོ་བ།

།འདོད་པའི་འབྲས་བུ་སྟེར་བར་བྱེད་པ་ནི།

།ཡིད་བཞིན་ཚོར་འདྲའི་སེམས་ལ་ཕྱག་འཚལ་ལོ།

[quote located in TBRC: eTexts 1.

༄༅། །ཕྱག་རྒྱ་ཆེན་པོའི་མན་ངག་གི་བཤད་སྐྱར་རྒྱལ་བའི་གན་མཛོད་ཅེས་བྱ་བ་བཞུགས་སོ། །

padma dkar po; gsung 'bum/_pad+ma dkar po; W10736. kargyud sungrab nyamso khang, darjeeling, 1973-1974.]

Mind itself alone is the seed of everything

Samsara and nirvana manifest from it

Homage to the mind, which is like a wishfulfilling jewel

Bestowing all desired results

Translation Jim Scott

Geist allein ist der Same für Alles —

von ihm strahlen Dasein und Nirvana aus.

Vollbringer wunschbegehrter Früchte,

Verehrung dem Geist, einem wunscherfüllenden Edelstein gleich.

Übersetzung Vajrabhadra

@ 00:35:20
@ 00:36:42
@ 00:37:38
@ 00:38:13
@ 00:39:30
@ 00:40:50
@ 00:41:21

Question:

In what sense can relative truth said to be true?

@ 00:41:33

Answer:

@ 00:43:23

@ 00:44:23

Karmapa Rangjung Dorje {kar ma pa rang byung rdo rje}

quote: {thams cad bden min rdzun min te}

|ཐམས་ཅད་བདེན་མིན་རླུན་མིན་ཏེ།

|ཀུ་སྐྱ་བཞིན་དུ་མཁས་རྣམས་འདོད།

[[ཐ་མལ་ཤེས་པ་འདི་ཉིད་ལ།

|ཚོས་དབྱིངས་རྒྱལ་བའི་སྣང་པོ་ཟེར།] SKK Vol 4 Fol 57v

Es gibt nichts was weder nicht wahr, noch nicht Lüge ist,
gleichsam wie die Mond-im-Wasser-Reflexion, so behaupten die Weisen.
[Das gewöhnlich-ursprüngliche Gewahrsein, dies selbst nun ist
bezeichnet mit Sphäre der Leere, Essenz des Siegreichen.] SKK Vol 4 Fol
57v

Übersetzung Vajrabhadra

@ 00:45:30

@ 00:46:40

@ 00:47:30

@ 00:48:10

@ 00:50:02

@ 00:50:53

@ 00:51:20

Nagarjuna +nAgArjuna in the »Fundamental Treatise on the Middle
Way«, the Mūlamadhyamakakārikā +mUlamadhyamakakArikA Chapter
XVIII: Ātmaparīkṣā +AtmaparīkSA / in the {dbu ma rtsa ba shes rab}

quote: {yod ces bya ba rtag par 'dzin}

ཡོད་ཅེས་བྱ་བ་རྟག་པར་འདྲིན།

མེད་ཅེས་བྱ་བ་ཆད་པར་སྟོ།

དེ་སྤྱིར་ཡོད་དང་མེད་པ་ལ།

མཁམས་པས་གནས་པར་མི་བྱའོ། Nagarjuna MMK 15v10

astīti śāśvatagrāho nāstīty ucchedadarśanam |

tasmād astitvanāstitve nāsrīyeta vicakṣaṇaḥ || Nagarjuna MMK 15v10

“Existence” is the grasping at permanence; “non-existence” is the view of annihilation. Therefore, the wise do not dwell, in existence or non-existence. 15v10

Translation Batchelor

Sagt man »es ist«, hält man an ewiger Dauer fest.

Sagt man »es ist nicht«, hat man die Vorstellung des Aufhörens [der Dinge].

Deshalb möge sich der Verständige nicht auf die beiden [Ansichten]

»es ist« und »es ist nicht« festlegen lassen. MMK 15v10

Übersetzung Weber-Brosamer / Back

@ 00:52:43

@ 00:53:03

Question:

Luminous clarity and about the connection between deep sleep and awareness

@ 00:53:48

Answer

@ 00:54:49

@ 00:55:27

@ 00:55:53

Nagarjuna +nAgArjuna in the »Fundamental Treatise on the Middle Way«, the Mūlamadhyamakakārikā +mUlamadhyamakakArikA Chapter XXII: Tathāgataparīkṣā +tathAgataparIkSA / in the {dbu ma rtsa ba shes rab}

quote: {stong ngo zhes kyang mi brjod de}

སྟོང་ངོ་ཞེས་ཀྱང་མི་བརྟེན་དེ།

མི་སྣོང་ཞེས་ཀྱང་མི་བྱ་ཞིང་།
ཁག་ཉིས་དང་གཉིས་མིན་མི་བྱ་སྟེ།
ཁག་གསུམ་པའི་དོན་དུ་བརྗོད་པར་བྱ། MMK 22v11

sūnyam iti na vaktavyam aśūnyam iti vā bhavet |
ubhayaṃ nobhayaṃ ceti prajñaptiyarthaṃ tu kathyate || MMK 22v11

Do not say “empty,” or “not empty,” or “both,” or “neither:” these are mentioned for the sake of [conventional] understanding.

Translation Batchelor

Man soll weder sagen »leer«,
noch »nicht-leer«,
auch nicht »beides zugleich« und auch nicht »keines von beidem«.
Zum Zwecke der Verständigung aber mag man so sprechen. MMK 22v11
Übersetzung Weber-Brosamer / Back

@ 00:57:00

@ 00:57:30

Question:

What is the connection between the Dharmadhatu and the Sambhogakaya in terms of clear light?

@ 00:58:40

Answer

@ 00:59:28

@ 00:59:40

@ 00:59:58

@ 01:01:30

@ 00:02:01

@ 01:02:38

Milarepa in his song »Equality and Seven Things to Forget« {mnyam nyid brjed pa bdun} p. 674

quote: {sku gsum rang chas rtogs tsa na}

སྐྱུ་གསུམ་རང་ཆས་རྟོགས་ཅོ་ན།

ལྷ་ཡི་བསྐྱེད་རིམ་བརྗོད་དེ་ཐལ།

བསམ་ངོའི་ཚོས་དེ་བརྗོད་ཀྱང་རུང་།

When I know the three kayas are present naturally

I forget all about the deity's generation stage practice
It's okay to forget the Dharma made of concepts
Translation Ari Goldfield

@ 01:04:40

@ 01:05:28

@ 01:05:43

@ 01:07:24

@ 01:09:57

@ 01:10:32

@ 01:11:00

@ 01:12:08

Question:

[How to explain appearance - emptiness to my grandfather?](#)

@ 01:13:40

Answer:

@ 01:14:50

Nagarjuna +nAgArjuna in the »Fundamental Treatise on the Middle Way«, the Mūlamadhyamakakārikā +mUlamadhyamakakArikA Chapter XXII: Tathāgataparīkṣā +tathAgataparIkSA / in the {dbu ma rtsa ba shes rab}

quote: {de bzhin gshegs pa'i rang bzhin gang }

།དེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པའི་རང་བཞིན་གང་།

།དེ་ནི་འགྲོ་འདྲིའི་རང་བཞིན་ཡིན།

།དེ་བཞིན་གཤེགས་པ་རང་བཞིན་མེད།

།འགྲོ་བ་འདྲི་ཡི་རང་བཞིན་མེད། MMK 22v16

tathāgato yatsvabhāvas tatsvabhāvam idaṃ jagat |

tathāgato niḥsvabhāvo niḥsvabhāvam idaṃ jagat || MMK 22v16

Whatever is the own-nature of the tathagata, that is the own-nature of this world. The tathagata has no own-nature. This world has no own-nature. MMK 22v16

Translation Batchelor

Das Eigensein des Tathagata +tathAgata

ist dasselbe wie das Eigensein dieser Welt der Lebenden;

wie [also] der Tathagata +tathAgata ohne Eigensein ist,
so ist auch diese Welt ohne Eigensein. MMK 22v16
Übersetzung Weber-Brosamer / Back

@ 01:15:47

furthermore in the view of Buddhnature, tathAgatagarbha it is said:

quote:

|བདེ་གཤེགས་སྣང་པོས་འགྲོ་ཀུན་ཡོངས་ལ་བྱབ།

|འགྲོ་བ་འདི་དག་ཐམས་ཅད་སངས་རྒྱས་ཡིན།

|དེས་ན་ངེས་ནས་{}སེམས་ཅན་གང་ཡང་མེད། ???? [quote not located; check spelling]

see: དཔལ་ཐེང་གི་མདོ་ལས། བདེ་གཤེགས་སྣང་པོས་འགྲོ་ཀུན་ཡོངས་ལ་བྱབ། །ཅེས་དང་། SKK VOL 3 Fol
87v

@ 01:16:42

@ 01:17:18

@ 01:17:58

@ 01:18:22

@ 01:18:45

@ 01:20:08

End of Question & Answer session

@ 01:21:05

@ 01:21:30

@ 01:21:40 FINIS [sudden stop]

END OF TALK